

## High Level Multistakeholder Committee HLMC

---

### **Meeting summary report**

**Date/time: February 24th, 2014 17:30~19:00**

**Place: GSMA, Barcelona, Spain**

### **Participants:**

HLMC Chairman: Paulo Bernardo Silva

NETmundial Chairman: Virgilio Almeida

European Commission: Neelie Kroes

Argentina: Juan Cruz Gonzalez Allonca

France: David Martinon

Germany: Dirk Brengelmann

Ghana: Edward Omane Boamah

South Africa: Yunus Carrim

Spain (HLMC meeting host country): D. Víctor Calvo-Sotelo

Tunisia: Tawfik Jelassi

Turkey: Emir Salim Yüksel

USA: Daniel Sepulveda

International Organizations (ITU): Fabio Leite

Civil Society: Louis Pouzin

Technical Community: Mathieu Weill

Technical Community: Tarek Kamel

Technical Community: Walda Roseman (representing Kathy Brown)

Private Sector: Christoph Steck

### **Remote connection:**

Academia: David Johnson

International Organizations (UNDESA): Elia Armstrong (representing Wu Hongbo)

Private Sector: Jimson Olufuye

Private Sector: Joseph Alhadeff

Civil Society: Jovan Kurbalija

Civil Society: Stephanie Perrin

Technical Community: Kathy Brown

### **Supporting personnel:**

Brazilian Ministry of Communications: Flavio Lenz, Maximiliano Martinhao, Alessandra Cardoso

European Commission: Pearse O`Donohue

Argentina: Anabel Cisneros

Ghana: Issah Yahaya

# NETmundial

Spain: D. Juan Corro

Tunisia: Mohamed Ben Amor

NETmundial Secretariat: Daniel Fink, Fabrizio Leonardo

Consulate of Brazil in Barcelona: Michel Laham

## **Agenda:**

1. Welcome message and Introduction of Participants (5 min)
2. Initial remarks (15 min)
  - H.E. Neelie Kroes - Vice President of European Commission for the Digital Agenda
  - D. Víctor Calvo-Sotelo - Secretary of State for Telecommunications and Information Society of Spain (Special Invitee)
  - Minister Paulo Bernardo - Minister of Communications of Brazil
3. Briefing and Introduction of the NETmundial structure and workflow (Secretary Virgílio Almeida) (10 min)
  - a. Background
  - b. Objectives and expected outcomes
  - c. Committees and interactions among them
  - d. Content contribution process
  - e. Synthesis paper and document drafting
  - f. Important dates
  - g. HLMC roles and Agenda
4. Open Floor & Discussion (40 min)
5. Summary and Closing Remarks (20 min)

## **Key messages addressed by participant:**

### **Paulo Bernardo Silva (HLMC chair):**

- For the Chairman of the Committee, the HLMC has one of the most important missions, which is to promote the participation of the international community. In this sense, he invited all members to engage each one of its respective communities. He also understands that HLMC has the responsibility of reviewing the draft documents to be proposed during the event.
- Emphasized that NETmundial is a short event, only 2 days, recommending a joint effort to produce a document with very positive outcomes. He remembered that this is not a simple task, since the intention is to build this document from the contributions and acceptance of all interested parties.

### **Virgílio Almeida (NETmundial chair):**

- The Chair of the Meeting presented the context of NETmundial in Brazil, described the Committees structures in details and also the existing mechanisms that have been conducted to establish the multistakeholder Meeting.

# NETmundial

- During the opportunity, he explained about the role of the HLMC. In his vision, the Committee is primarily responsible for setting the political tone and providing international visibility to NETmundial. The practical aspects of this responsibility are the capacity to review the documents prepared by EMC, provide feedback with suggestions and return them to the NETmundial Board. The NETmundial Board will interact directly with the EMC to achieve a final version of these documents by the beginning of the conference. During the meeting, the HLMC and the Chairs of NETmundial will seek approval for the final documents. Given that it is a two-day conference, it will be important to have an accepted document by different multistakeholders with some concrete suggestions for the IG ecosystem.
- Was also presented a balance of Expression of Interest and Content Contribution received so far.
- The Chair informed that the Brazilian Government is also working on a document to be submitted to the consideration of the conference. The contribution is being prepared under the coordination of the chief of staff of the President to represent the official Brazilian position as one of the countries involved in the conference.

## **H.E. Neelie Kroes (European Commission):**

- Expressed that the next two years will be absolutely critical in redrawing the global map of the IG and the choices to global leaders are to be successful or really to be blamed.
- She emphasized that she does not want to witness another talk show and it should be crystal clear that outputs should be focused on IG principles and roadmap.
- Clarified that Europe would not make connections between surveillance practices and the debate on internet governance. However, it is also necessary to keep in mind some realities such as the recent trust issues in the global internet, including its technical infrastructure and its governance. More than awareness, an answer should also be in place considering real political and legal risks that could ultimately lead to a technical fragmentation of the global internet. That should be avoided. In order to do that, a credible evolutionary path for a sustainable evolution of the internet should be put forward.
- It should not be a shame for governments to be ambitious. If there is no ambition in this project, then there is a loss of credibility since there is no way to explain the absence of reasons to take action. The reasons exist and people are expecting that this problem is tackled.

## **Ambassador Dirk Brengelmann (Germany):**

- Asked for more information about activities taken by EMC to foster conclusions, decisions and consensus in the very critical period where it is supposed to put together the synthesis. It was requested an early circulation of the synthesis around March, remembering the multistakeholder system advised by the Brazilian President where all the players need to be involved.
- One of the principles that Germany included in its contribution has to do with privacy issues following up on the Brazil-German talks related to privacy. It was also included some indications of the role of multistakeholders in the future process.
- He also observes some alignment among the EC, French and USA contributions and a good perspective to engage in substance.

## **Minister Yunus Carrim (South Africa):**

# NETmundial

- Informed that NETmundial comes in the eve of elections by May 2<sup>nd</sup>, and it would be unlikely an attendance at ministerial level. He ensured that senior officials will be in Sao Paulo.

## **Minister Tawfik Jelassi (Tunisia):**

- Echoed the advice for avoiding another talk show, proposing the adoption of concrete actions and contributions that are meaningful to help boost ICT and internet as major enabler for socioeconomic development taking into account the truly multistakeholder approach.

## **Minister Edward Omane Boamah (Ghana):**

- Informed that his government will submit our contributions on mechanisms for the sustainable governance of the internet as well as democratic principles. He added that the President of Ghana is a former Minister of Communications and brought his willingness to participate in the process.
- It was advised that the short duration of NETmundial (2 days) should not be a stumbling block to obtain concrete goals, since committee members coming from business community, ICANN and others are working very hard towards a future in Brazil.

## **David Martinon, Special Representative for international negotiations on the Information Society and the Digital Economy (France):**

- Informed his alignment following the talks from European Commission and Germany to strengthen the multistakeholder model in Sao Paulo.
- The submission of content contribution from France is confirmed and will be focused in the roadmap and on the principles, also including data privacy. The French contribution to NETmundial is under a consulting process in order to build a consensus before the submission.
- France agrees that ICANN issue should not be the main topic of the Sao Paulo meeting, but decisions are still to be taken in the way forward.

## **Fabio Leite (ITU):**

- He took the opportunity to welcome Brazil's timely efforts to facilitate a global dialogue on the important matters of NETmundial and look forward to transparent, open, constructive and meaningful discussions that are inclusive to all nations and stakeholders with a view of ensuring a better internet for all.

## **Chairman Virgilio Almeida**

- Informed that the Brazilian Government is also working in a document to be submitted to the consideration of the conference. The contribution is being prepared under the coordination of the chief of staff of the President to represent the official Brazilian position as one of the countries involved in the conference.

## **Ambassador Daniel Sepulveda (USA):**

- Informed that United States Government made a submission on Friday (Feb 21<sup>st</sup>) and at the core of this submission is first to achieve what you want to achieve all have to present some degree of flexibility and agree that the process is very cooperative in good will.
- Affirmed that there are two important caveats that, one, as stated, the meeting is organized and executed in a multistakeholder fashion and its outcomes should reflect the

# NETmundial

commitment to that process. Strengthening all the multistakeholder process ensuring that its fully inclusive and respected by all participants.

## **Tarek Kamel (Technical Community – ICANN)**

- Advised that is very important to have a strong and high level attendance to provide legitimacy to the event and to the process and more efforts should be devoted by each HLMC member on this direction.
- Mentioned was the ICANN Board decision to support the CEO for the ICANN globalization process. Although this is not the main topic for Sao Paulo, it will definitely help to push the dialogue forward in terms of principles and global ecosystem.
- Asked about clarifications in the process of producing a document after the end of parallel sessions in NETmundial, more specifically, what is the plan for synthesizing all inputs that will result in the communique.
- Another point was his concern about an escalation on expectations in the community about ICANN and IANA globalization, surveillance, neutrality, spam, and so forth. It is a duty for the HLMC to be ambitious, to do the maximum, but also to take decisions and set the appropriate tone for the community.

## **Valda Roseman (Technical Community – ISOC)**

- Informed that ISOC talks aims at open and resilient principles and an accessible framework for the world.

## **Luis Pouzin (Civil Society):**

- Informed that his community is still working and coming up with a number of principles to submit as contribution to NETmundial and framework aiming to make the internet more respectful to human rights.
- The online world must enjoy the same human rights as the offline one, there must not be discrimination in access and contents due to criteria such as opinion, religion, race, gender, geography, language, or economic resources. In addition, online world there should be equitable, sometimes translated as network neutrality.
- No company, institution or state should have dominance in terms of traffic. It was also mentioned that Internet availability, deployment, and service conditions must benefit all segments of the human society, not just those enjoying richer economic development. A special effort must be engaged in order to provide the Less Developed Countries with an equitable share of resources to participate in activities related to worldwide internet governance.

## **Christopher Steck (Private Sector):**

- The internet has evolved over the last years so naturally there has been an evolution in the process. At the same time, there should be clear that it's not possible to solve all issues in the conference.

## **Contributions from remote participants (received by text):**

### **Joseph Alhadef (Private Sector):**

*There have been significant discussions about the difficulty of getting to consensus, in this compressed time frame. While we all share the desire to work towards that objective we note that*

# NETmundial

*there are many sets of principles already in existence as highlighted by work posted to 1-Net as well as work that was undertaken by the ICANN experts report. If we set the objective as only some form of issuance of principles then an inability to achieve that objective would seem to be a failure.*

*We should perhaps have an objective as to progress towards such a confluence of themes across existing principles and positions. Should we be able to deliver more all the better. The Minister from Ghana is making this point as well, I believe. Finally we would underscore the need to assure stability, unity and operational continuity of the system.*

*Further to the comment of civil society as to organization, we are working on developing a common business position. We see our role more as Liasons than representatives per se and thus our ability to have time for consultation with the broader group is highly valued and essential. We would urge that processes be maintained to assure this ability for consultation to assure the ability to properly reflect the breadth of views within the community.*

## **Private Sector: Jimson Olufuye**

*Good evening the Chair, your excellences, distinguished ladies and gentlemen. My name is Jimson Olufuye, Chair of AfICTA - Africa ICT Alliance, a private sector-led ICT initiative for Africa and the CEO of Kontemporary, an ICT SME based in Abuja, Nigeria. I'm pleased to be one of the 3 biz reps in this Committee. I've a brief comment and an expression of expectations of many from the business community, with special focus on the African ICT sector, which I am part of, for the NETMundial. Since the 2005 WSIS, when participation in the global IG discussions began its evolutionary transformation into truly MS mechanisms and processes, the private sector has continued to participate prominently and the diversity of such participation is evident by my inclusion, along with others from the private sector, in the membership of this Committee. So, African businesses and in particular businesses in developing and least developed economies see continuous growth and development through the platform provided by the Internet and as such are very much interested in the NETMundial meeting as one avenue where further examinations of how to support building CONFIDENCE, assuring STABILITY, strengthening the SECURITY and the RESILIENCY of one un-fragmented Internet.*

*As we prepare, there is need for: 1. Constructive and continuous engagement with all stakeholders in line with the focus of NETMundial. 2. Openness, broad and fair participation of all stakeholders representatives in the discussions and debates. 3. Awareness that there is a much broader range of critically important and related events, and that NETMundial is part of a larger ecosystem where the outputs of NETMundial can be considered further. 4. Accelerated processing of invitation letters for visas or possibly visa on arrival for accredited participants? As well as a focus on other mechanisms which enable fair and balanced participation, including language translation, transcription of sessions, and a balanced approach to inclusion of speakers and participants. It is my experience that many concerned and interested participants will want to listen actively, and we must accommodate that, if NETMundial is to be seen as fair and open. 5. Empowerment of effective participation of stakeholders from developing and least developed economies through fair and accountable funding support mechanisms. Where that may not be 100% possible, robust arrangement as indicated should be made to enable remote participation and webcast of proceedings of the event. Also, I must note that small businesses, and their representatives must be treated on an equal footing with all other funded participants, if we are to have the balance of all voices. 6. Finally, I want to note that while welcoming and fully planning engagement in the NETMundial event, I join with others from all stakeholders, in the IGF MAG, who noted the importance of NETMundial planning to participate fully in the upcoming IGF in Turkey, 2-5 September, this year.*